

SYLLABUS
HPM 510—SECTION 001
SPRING 2009

Draft: 9-19-08

Title of Course: Global Perspectives on Ethical Issues in HPM

Professor: Dean M. Harris, J.D.
1104A McGavran-Greenberg Hall
Department of Health Policy and Management
UNC School of Public Health
CB # 7411
Chapel Hill, N.C. 27599-7411
Dean_Harris@unc.edu

Teaching Assistant: _____

Class Times: The class will meet on Monday evenings from 6:00 pm to 8:50 pm. As indicated on the schedule, for some of the sessions we will have webcasts or pre-recorded lectures with PPT slides, which will count as part of our contact hours for that week. Those webcasts and pre-recorded lectures are required. However, it is not necessary to watch those webcasts and pre-recorded lectures as a group during class time. Rather, rather you may watch them at your convenience at any time prior to the class period for that particular topic.

Location: _____

Course Description: This course will address the ethical issues of health policy and management, with particular attention to the global perspectives on these issues. These global perspectives are both comparative and trans-national. Thus, we will compare the ethical approaches to health system issues in various countries, such as the different perspectives on informed consent, refusal of treatment, physician-assisted suicide, and reproductive health. The course will address global perspectives on the ethical issues in rationing of care, allocation of resources, and cost-containment; ethical issues of corruption, kickbacks, and conflicts of interest; and ethical aspects of research with human subjects in both developing and developed countries. We will also consider the cross-border issues that arise from movement of patients and providers across national boundaries, such as treatment of undocumented aliens, medical tourism, and the “brain drain” of health care personnel from developing countries. Finally, the course will deal with organizational ethics and compliance, including ethical issues for U.S. health care professionals and organizations providing services in other countries.

Readings and Other Assignments: The course will include readings, class discussions, webcasts, pre-recorded lectures, and group projects by the students.

There is no text for this course. Instead, reading assignments will be posted on Blackboard, identified on the internet, or otherwise available to all UNC students on the E-Journal Finder of UNC Libraries at <<http://eresources.lib.unc.edu/ejournal/>>. Assignments include a group presentation to the class and a final paper from each group.

Course Requirements and Grading: Grades in this course will be based on the midterm exam (20%), the final exam (20%), group projects (40%), and class participation in general (20%). The midterm exam will be held during class on March 2, 2009. The final exam will be held during class on April 27, 2009, and will be cumulative. The group projects will include an oral presentation by the group and a written paper by the group. In order to receive the benefit of your group's grade on the group project, you must have a passing grade (as determined by the professor) on your individual work in this course.

Goals and Objectives: The goals and objectives of this course are to:

1. Learn how ethical theories apply to the provision of health care services in both developing and developed countries;
2. Read and analyze a representative sample of the literature on ethics in health policy and administration;
3. Examine the ways in which ethical issues arise in specific contexts of patient care, such as informed consent, refusal of treatment, physician-assisted suicide, and human reproduction, and consider the global perspectives on these ethical issues;
4. Think about the ethical aspects of policy decisions in the health care industry, such as rationing of care, conducting research with human subjects, and regulating managed care organizations;
5. Evaluate the different ways of promoting ethical decision-making in health care organizations; and
6. Think about the global perspectives on ethical issues in health policy and administration.

Exit Competencies: By the end of the course, students should be able to:

1. Explain the major theories of ethics and how they apply in the health care field;
2. Analyze writings on ethics in order to identify the author's thesis and rationale, as well as the strengths and weaknesses of the author's position and the strengths and weaknesses of the contrary positions;
3. Identify situations that raise ethical issues in the health care system, and articulate the basic ethical arguments for each potential solution;
4. Understand how to incorporate ethics into the decision-making processes of health care organizations and the society at large; and
5. Identify and explain the global perspectives on these ethical issues.

CLASS SCHEDULE AND ASSIGNMENTS

Note: These topics and assignments are subject to change by the professor.

Class 1 -- January 12: Introduction and Overview

- A. Preview of issues
- B. Housekeeping matters
- C. In-class activity on the ethical issues in developing a new hospital in the Republic of Tuvunu (posted on Blackboard as a course document)

Required readings for this class:

Marshall, P and B Koenig, "Accounting for Culture in a Globalized Bioethics", *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, (2004) 32: 252-66.

The Belmont Report (posted on Blackboard as a course document).

Recommended readings for this class:

WHO, "Ethics of the Health Systems: Report of the Third Futures Forum for High-level Decisionmakers" (Stockholm, 2002) (posted on Blackboard as a course document).

Beauchamp, T, Methods and Principles in Biomedical Ethics (Festschrift), *Journal of Medical Ethics*, (October 2003), 29(5):269-74.

NOTE: Class will not be held on January 19, 2009 (Martin Luther King Day).

Class 2 – January 26: Global Perspectives on Informed Consent, Refusal of Treatment, and Physician-assisted Suicide

- A. Pre-Recorded Lecture Module 1A: Introduction to Ethics in Health Policy and Administration (29 minutes)
- B. Pre-Recorded Lecture Module 1B: Ethical Theories or Approaches (25 minutes)
- C. Class discussion of global perspectives on autonomy and informed consent

Required readings for this class:

Blackhall, L, et al, "Bioethics in a Different Tongue: The Case of Truth-Telling", *Journal of Urban Health*, (March 2001) 78(1):59-71.

Akabayashi, A and B Slingsby, "Informed Consent Revisited: Japan and the U.S.", *American Journal of Bioethics*, (2006) 6(1): 9-14.

Arras, J. "Physician-Assisted Suicide: A Tragic View", *Journal of Contemporary Health Law & Policy*, (1997) 13:361-89, but only need to read pages 365-74 (top) and 386-89.

Nuland, S, "Editorial: Physician-Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia in Practice", *New England Journal of Medicine* (February 24, 2000) 342:583-84.

Recommended readings for this class:

Annas, G and F Miller, "The Empire of Death: How Culture and Economics Affect Informed Consent in the U.S., the U.K., and Japan," *American Journal of Law & Medicine*, (1994) XX(4): 357-94.

Angell, M, Editorial: Euthanasia in the Netherlands—Good News or Bad?", *New England Journal of Medicine* (November 28, 1996) 335:1676-78.

Hedayat, K and R Pirzadeh, "Issues in Islamic Biomedical Ethics: A Primer for the Pediatrician", *Pediatrics*, (October 4, 2001) 108(4): 965-971.

Class 3 – February 2: Abortion and Emergency Contraception

- A. Pre-Recorded Lecture Module 3A: Ethical Issues in Abortion (32 minutes)
- B. Pre-Recorded Lecture Module 3B: Ethics of Abortion in Different Places and Times (16 minutes)
- C. Class discussion of abortion and the "global gag rule"
- D. In-class activity on the ethical issues of emergency contraception in Gouanastan (posted on Blackboard as a course document)

Required readings for this class:

Larijani, B and F Zahedi, "Changing Parameters for Abortion in Iran", *Indian Journal of Medical Ethics*, (October-December 2006) III(4):130-31.

Center for Reproductive Rights, “Voices from Nepal—Excerpts from Abortion in Nepal: Women Imprisoned”, Item: F054 (April 2002), available at <http://www.reproductiverights.org/pub_fac_nepal.html>.

Center for Reproductive Rights, “The Global Gag Rule’s Effects on NGOs in 56 Countries”, Item F034 (June 2003), available at <http://www.reproductiverights.org/pub_fac_ggreffects.html>.

John Paul II, “The Unspeakable Crime of Abortion”, available at <http://www.vatican.va/edocs/ENG0141/___PQ.HTM>.

Women on Waves, “Welcome” available at <www.womenonwaves.org>.

Class 4 – February 9: Female genital mutilation (plus selection of group projects and dates for class presentations)

- A. Pre-recorded Lecture Module 4A: Ethical Issues of Female Genital Mutilation (FGM) (34 minutes)
- B. In-class activity on the ethical issues in a proposed hospital policy on FGM (contained in slides 11-14 of Lecture Module 4A, and also posted on Blackboard as a course document)
- C. Discussion and selection of group projects and dates for class presentations

Required readings for this class:

Turillazzi, E and V Fineschi, “Female Genital Mutilation: The Ethical Impact of the New Italian Law”, *Journal of Medical Ethics* (2007) 33:98-101.

Schroeder, P, “Editorial: Female Genital Mutilation—A Form of Child Abuse”, *New England Journal of Medicine*, (September 15, 1994) 331:739-40.

Althaus, F, “Female Circumcision: Right of Passage or Violation of Rights?” *International Family Planning Perspectives*, (September 1997) 23(3), available at www.guttmacher.org/pubs/journals/2313097.html.

Recommended readings for this class:

Toubia, N, “Female Circumcision as a Public Health Issue”, *New England Journal of Medicine* (1994) 331:712-16 (with correction).

Kluge, E, “Female Circumcision: When Medical Ethics Confronts Cultural Values”, *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, (1993) 148(2):288-89.

Class 5 – February 16: Ethical issues in the movement of patients and providers across national borders

- A. Pre-recorded Lecture Module 5A: Ethical, Legal, and Practical Issues in Treating Undocumented Aliens (46 minutes)
- B. Pre-recorded Lecture Module 5B: Issues in Treating Patients with Limited English Proficiency (23 minutes)
- C. Class discussion of ethical issues, such as treating undocumented aliens in the USA (including organ transplants), medical tourism by U.S. residents to other countries (including “transplant tourism”), workforce migration, recruiting, and “brain drain”
- D. In-class activity on the ethical issue of whether persons with limited English proficiency have a right to a translator at the hospital’s expense (contained in slide 14 of Lecture Module 5B and also posted on Blackboard as a course document)

Required readings for this class:

Preston, J, “Texas Hospitals Reflect Debate on Immigration”, *New York Times*, (July 18, 2006).

Williams, H, “Allocating a Future: Ethics and Organ Transplantation”, Markkula Center for Applied Ethics, available at http://scu.edu/ethics/publications/submitted/allocating_organ.html

Morgan, D, “Medical Tourism: Ethical Baggage and Legal Currencies”, (December 3, 2003), available at <[http://www.bma.org.uk/ap.nsf/Content/MedicalEthicsTomorrowConfPapers/\\$file/MedTourism.pdf](http://www.bma.org.uk/ap.nsf/Content/MedicalEthicsTomorrowConfPapers/$file/MedTourism.pdf)>.

Narayan, T, “Editorial: Challenges of the National Rural Health Mission”, *Indian Journal of Medical Ethics*, (April-June 2005).

Chen, L and J Boufford, “Fatal Flows—Doctors on the Move”, *New England Journal of Medicine*, (2005) 353(17):1850-52.

Recommended readings for this class:

Vedantam, S, “U.S. Citizens Get More Organs Than They Give”, *Washington Post* (March 3, 2003), A03.

United Network for Organ Sharing, "Transplantation of Non-Resident Aliens", Policy No. 6, available at <www.unos.org/policiesandbylaws/policies.asp?resources=true>.

Commonwealth Secretariat, "Human Resources for Health: The Commonwealth Code of Practice for the International Recruitment of Health Workers (with Companion Document)", available at <http://www.thecommonwealth.org/Internal/166024/34042/human_resources_for_health/>.

Chaguturu, S and S Vallabhaneni, "Aiding and Abetting—Nursing Crises at Home and Abroad", *New England Journal of Medicine*, (2005) 353(17):1761-63.

Sontag, D, "Immigrants Facing Deportation by U.S. Hospitals", *New York Times*, (August 3, 2008).

Class 6 – February 23: Ethical issues of research with human subjects in developing countries and developed countries

- A. Class discussion of ethical issues in research with human subjects
- B. In-class activity on the ethical issues of access to an experimental drug without participating in a clinical trial (posted on Blackboard as a course document)

Required readings for this class:

Shapiro, H, and E Meslin, "Ethical Issues in the Design and Conduct of Clinical Trials in Developing Countries", *New England Journal of Medicine*, (2001) 345(2):139-42.

Hawkins, J, "Justice and Placebo Controls", *Social Theory and Practice*, (2006) 32(3):467 (30).

World Medical Association, "Declaration of Helsinki" (with notes of clarification added in 2002 and 2004), available at < <http://www.wma.net/e/policy/b3.htm>>.

Lie, R, et al, "The Standard of Care Debate: The Declaration of Helsinki Versus the International Consensus Opinion", *Journal of Medical Ethics*, (2004) 30:190-93.

Schuklenk, U, "The Standard of Care Debate: Against the Myth of an 'International Consensus Opinion'", *Journal of Medical Ethics*, (2004) 30:194-97.

Recommended readings for this class:

Benatar, S, "Commentary: Justice and Medical Research: A Global Perspective", *Bioethics*, (2001) 15(4):333-40.

McMillan, J and C Conlon, "The Ethics of Research Related to Health Care in Developing Countries", *Journal of Medical Ethics*, (2004) 30:204-06.

Class 7 – March 2: Midterm Examination

- A. The midterm exam will be held during class time.
- B. After you take the midterm exam, please watch the webcast of a debate on July 10, 2003 between two experts on medical ethics about the issue of rationing health care by age. The participants in that debate are Daniel Callahan and Christine Cassel. Daniel Callahan was one of the founders of the Hastings Center and is now Director of its international program, as well as being a Senior Fellow at Harvard Medical School. Christine Cassel is head of the American Board of Internal Medicine and was Dean of the School of Medicine at the Oregon Health & Science University. The debate lasts for 55 minutes. The link to the site for that webcast is as follows: <<http://www.sagecrossroads.net/webcast06>>. I have posted that on the Blackboard site for our course as an external link. On the site for that webcast, there is also a link to the transcript of that debate. It is not necessary to read the transcript, but you may find it to be useful. (I have also posted the transcript as a PDF file on the Blackboard site for our course, on the same page as the external link.) **Please note:** This material in this webcast will not be covered on the midterm exam, but rather that material is part of our next topic after the midterm exam.

NOTE: Class will not be held on March 9, 2009 (Spring Break).

Class 8 – March 16: Ethical issues in rationing, allocation of resources, and cost-containment

- A. Watch the webcast by Ian Sanne of the University of Witwatersrand in South Africa entitled : Rationing ART for HIV/AIDS in Settings Where Demand Exceeds Supply: What Options Are Available? This presentation was part of a conference in Paris on November 2, 2006 about access to ART in low-income countries. It is not necessary to listen to the entire conference, but only the 36-minute session about rationing ART, including the questions and answers following his presentation. The link to the site for the webcast of that conference is as follows:
http://www.kaisernetwork.org/health_cast/hcast_index.cfm?display=detail&hc=1970 (I have posted that on the Blackboard site for our course as an external link. In addition, there is a link to Ian Sanne's slides on the webcast site. You should view his slides while you listen to his presentation. In addition, I have posted a PDF file of his slides on the Blackboard site for our course, on the same page as the external link.)
- B. Watch the webcast by Henry Aaron of the Brookings Institution about rationing in the United States and the United Kingdom. This is a 15-minute webcast from the Kaiser Family Foundation Broadcast Studio in Washington, D.C. on February 16, 2006. The link to the site for that webcast is as follows:
http://www.kaisernetwork.org/health_cast/hcast_index.cfm?create=high_windows&linkid=1&display=detail&hc=1662 (I have posted that on the Blackboard site for our course as an external link. On that webcast site, there is a link to the transcript of Henry Aaron's presentation. It is not necessary to read the transcript, but you may find it to be useful. I have also posted the transcript of his presentation as a PDF file on the Blackboard site for our course, on the same page as the external link.)
- C. Class discussion of ethical issues in rationing, allocation of resources, and cost-containment
- D. In-class activity on the ethical issues in three options for spending a finite sum of money on health coverage in Yulatonga (posted on Blackboard as a course document)

Required readings for this class:

Newdick, C, "Accountability for Rationing—Theory into Practice. (Legislating and Litigating Health Care Rights Around the World)(United Kingdom)", *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, (2005) 33(4):660 (9).

Fenton, D, "Is Health Rationing the Answer?", BBC News (February 13, 2006), available at < <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/health/4706604.stm>>.

Mello, M and T Brennan, "The Controversy Over High-Dose Chemotherapy With Autologous Bone Marrow Transplant for Breast Cancer", *Health Affairs*, (2001) 20(5):101-17.

Recommended readings for this class:

Wirtz, V et al, "Understanding the Role of 'the Hidden Curriculum' in Resource Allocation—The Case of the UK NHS", *Health Care Analysis*, (2003) 11(4): 295-300.

Class 9 – March 23: Corruption, kickbacks, and conflicts of interest—ethical issues in different health systems

- A. Possible short webcast (to be announced in advance)—SEE 2008 SYLLABUS FOR POSSIBILITIES**
- B. Class discussion of health sector corruption and informal payments in various countries: Is corruption bad for your (and other people's) health?
- C. In-class activity on the ethical issues in developing a hospital plan to stop the collection of informal fees from patients (posted on Blackboard as a course document)

Required readings for this class:

Menon-Johansson, A, "Good Governance and Good Health: The Role of Societal Structures in the Human Immunodeficiency Virus Pandemic," *BMC International Health and Human Rights*, (2005) 5:4, available online at <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-698X/5/4>

Ensor, T and A Duran-Moreno, "Chapter 5: Corruption as a Challenge to Effective Regulation in the Health Sector" in R Saltman, et al, *Regulating Entrepreneurial Behavior in European Health Care Systems* (WHO 2002),

available online from the website of the European Observatory on Health Care Systems at <http://www.euro.who.int/document/e74487.pdf>.

Tatar, M et al, "Informal Payments in the Health Sector: A Case Study from Turkey", *Health Affairs*, (2007) 26(4):1029-39.

Recommended readings for this class:

Lewis, M, "Informal Payments and the Financing of Health Care in Developing and Transition Countries", *Health Affairs*, (2007) 26(4):984-97.

Ensor, T, "Informal Payments for Health Care in Transition Economies", *Social Science & Medicine*, (2004) 58:237-46.

Barber, S et al, "Formalizing Under-the-Table Payments to Control Out-of-Pocket Hospital Expenditures in Cambodia", *Health Policy and Planning*, (2004) 19(4):199-208.

Class 10 – March 30: Meet in Final Project Groups

- A. All final project groups will meet during class time in our regular classroom
- B. During this class, the professor will meet individually with each group

Assignment for this class: Work on your final group project.

Class 11 – April 6: Group presentations and class discussion

Assignment for this class: Prepare your group presentation

Class 12 – April 13: Group presentations and class discussion

Assignment for this class: Prepare your group presentation

Class 13 – April 20: Organizational ethics and compliance (and final group papers are due)

- A. Class discussion of ethical issues for U.S. healthcare professionals and organizations providing services in other countries (such as responding to requests for gifts or bribes from officials of foreign governments). Also, how can we encourage healthcare organizations and individuals to “do the right thing”? Are theories of ethics helpful in making ethical decisions?
- B. Reconsider the in-class activity for Class No. 1 regarding the ethical issues in developing a new hospital in the Republic of Tuvunu (posted on Blackboard as a course document). Has this course changed or confirmed your initial conclusions about the ethical issues in that activity?

Assignment for this class: Submit your final group paper

Recommended reading for this class:

Winkler, E and R Gruen, “First Principles: Substantive Ethics for Healthcare Organizations”, *Journal of Healthcare Management*, (2005) 50(2):109-20.

Class 14 – April 27: Wrap-up and conclusion (plus final examination)

- A. Final class discussion
- B. Final examination during class time
- C. Peer evaluations of group members

Assignment for this class: Study for the final examination

COURSE EVALUATION

The Department of Health Policy and Administration is participating in the Carolina Course Evaluation System (CES), the university's new online course evaluation tool, enabled at the end of each semester. Your responses will be anonymous, with feedback provided in the aggregate; open-ended comments will be shared with instructors, but not identified with individual students. Your participation in CES is a course requirement, as providing constructive feedback is a professional expectation. Such feedback is critical to improving the quality of our courses, as well as providing input to the assessment of your instructors.

HONOR CODE

The principles of academic honesty, integrity, and responsible citizenship govern the performance of all academic work and student conduct at the University as they have during the long life of this institution. Your acceptance of enrollment in the University presupposes a commitment to the principles embodied in the Code of Student Conduct and a respect for this most significant Carolina tradition. Your reward is in the practice of these principles.

Your participation in this course comes with the expectation that your work will be completed in full observance of the Honor Code. Academic dishonesty in any form is unacceptable, because any breach in academic integrity, however small, strikes destructively at the University's life and work.

If you have any questions about your responsibility or the responsibility of faculty members under the Honor Code, please consult with someone in either the Office of the Student Attorney General (966-4084) or the Office of the Dean of Students (6-4042).

ACADEMIC DISRUPTION EXERCISE

HPAA is committed to developing and testing alternatives for continuing classes in the face of various disruptions. During this semester we may run such a test. If this course participates, you will be informed in advance about the nature of the exercise and actions to take. We appreciate your full cooperation in this very important endeavor.